

Meeting	Extraordinary meeting of the ICE Reservoirs Committee
Date	9 January 2026
Time	9:30am – 10:30am
Venue	MS Teams
Chair	David Balmforth
Panel members (voting)	Alan Brown Kenneth Barr David Neeve Debbe Cooke
Ex Officio (non-voting)	Jonathan Sewell (Scottish Government) Phillip Morgan (Natural Resources Wales) James Ashworth, (Scottish Environment Protection Agency) Sam Deeley (Welsh Government) Mark Acford (Environment Agency) Violeta Morosan (Department for Infrastructure Northern Ireland) Sara Fletcher (Scottish Government) Chris Jones, (Welsh Government) Alice Baverstock (Department for Environment Food and Rural Affairs)) Nasim Rahman (Environment Agency)
Apologies	Jim Hall Andrew Thomson Jasvir Malia Dominic Molyneux Chris Scott Martin Deane David Littlemore
Secretariat	Brendan van Rooyen - ICE

1. Welcome and Apologies

The Chair, Professor David Balmforth, opened the meeting and welcomed attendees. He confirmed that the meeting would be recorded for transcription purposes and reminded members that all matters being discussed were strictly confidential. **[Post Meeting Note]** *In line with standard practice a public version of the minutes will be prepared and published on ice.org.uk. These will be approved by the Committee before publication.*

The Chair noted that attendees from DEFRA, the Welsh Government, NRW and EA were present as observers only, owing to potential conflict of interest. Observers were not permitted to participate in deliberations or voting. The Chair also noted that those voting committee members who may have potential conflicts of interest were not present and are noted as apologies.

2. Purpose of the Meeting

The Chair outlined that the meeting had been convened to consider the Committee's recommendation to the Secretary of State regarding an All Reservoir Panel Engineer's position on the All Reservoirs Panel, following an interview held as part of Step 15 of the DEFRA and Welsh Government's Capability Process and that the documentation from the interview had been shared with the Committee.

The Committee confirmed receipt of the documentation listed below and that it was read and considered.

- Interview Report for the Engineer
- 3 x Interview Assessment forms (RC18) from the interview panel members
- Spreadsheet linking areas of concern to the All Reservoir Panel attributes
- Copy of the DEFRA and Welsh Government Capabilities Process
- Draft recommendation wording for Defra.

The Chair ran through the purpose of each document and invited comments from the Committee on each document. No questions were raised regarding the documentation.

3. Consideration of Recommendations

3.1 Reinstatement to the All Reservoirs Panel

The Committee discussed the recommendation from the interview panel that the engineer should not be reinstated to the All Reservoirs Panel. The Chair invited comments from the Committee. The Chair

asked if there were any Committee members who were not in agreement with the recommendation.

No comments were received and no-one indicated that they were in disagreement with the recommendation.

Decision:

The Committee unanimously agreed (voting members only) not to recommend reinstatement.

3.2 Duration of Removal

The Committee considered the proposed duration of removal from the interview panel:

- A five-year total period,
- Measured from the start of the engineer's original suspension,

In discussion, members noted the following:

- **redacted**
- **redacted**
- **redacted**

Members agreed that five years represented a proportionate and fair period.

Decision:

A five-year removal period, backdated to the start of suspension, was unanimously agreed by voting members.

3.3 Status of Any Future Application

The Committee considered the recommendation that any future application by the engineer should be treated as a new applicant submission.

This would require compliance with all standard requirements for new candidates in place at the time of application.

Decision:

The Committee unanimously agreed (voting members) that the engineer would be treated as a new applicant should they choose to reapply.

4. Formal Confirmation of Committee Agreement

At the request of members, the Chair sought a clear recorded indication of agreement. Voting members raised hands via Microsoft Teams. The Secretariat confirmed that all voting Committee members supported the recommendations in full. Observers and non-voting members did not participate. Mr Jonathan Sewell (Scottish Government) noted that Scottish Government chose to participate only as an observer.

5. Next Steps and Submission to Defra

The Committee agreed that the Secretariat would finalise the written advice to Defra on the same day, noting that it was the final working day for the responsible DEFRA officer.

An explanatory note would be added describing the meaning of “application as a new applicant,” for clarity for the appeal officer and ministers.

The Secretariat and Chair agreed to finalise the drafting immediately following the meeting.

[POST MEETING NOTE] *The Reservoirs Committee's Recommendation was sent to the case officer at DEFRA on 9 January 2026.*

6. Any Other Business

No further business was raised.

